HAILEY PLANNING & ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES
Monday, March 15, 2010

The meeting was called to order at 6:30 pm by Commission Vice Chair Michael Pogue. Commissioners present were David Lloyd, Mark Johnstone and Geoff Moore. Staff present was Planning Director Beth Robrahm, Planner Mariel Platt, and Assistant Becky Mead.

Consent Agenda
Approval of Minutes – March 1, 2010

Commissioner Lloyd moved to approve the consent agenda. Commissioner Johnstone second, Commissioner Pogue abstained, the motion passed.

New Business
Hailey Rodeo Park Design Review
An application by the City of Hailey for Design Review of the Rodeo Grounds Park, located on portions of the lots located within Block 126, portions of the lots and alley located within Block 127, all of Block 134 and vacated portions of the Second Avenue, First Avenue and Cedar Street right-of-way (791 S Main Street) within the Limited Business (LB) district.

Planner Platt gave an overview of the application. She said the Tree Committee and Parks and Lands Board submitted a memo which is in the packet with their own suggestions of conditions of approval.

Nick Latham introduced himself and Michael Bulls, Ruscitto, Latham, Blanton, Architects for the project. He also stated that Paul Stoops is the Electrical Engineer and Lighting Consultant, and Kurt Eggers from Eggers & Associates is the Landscape Architect.

Michael Bulls presented the application to the Commission. He said the lot is 5.38 acres which has five components that consist of (1) multi use rodeo arena, (2) indoor ice rink, (3) interpretive center, (4) expansion of the existing skate park, and (5) improved circulation. He gave an overview of the existing components of the property. Bulls gave the setbacks for each component. He gave an overview of the indoor ice rink. He said the multi use arena is oversized for a regulation arena so they reconfigured the arena to conform to a standard regulation arena. He said they are proposing grand stand seating around the perimeter, providing permanent grandstand steel bleachers which provides for 3500 people; he said underneath the bleachers will be the restrooms and concessions. He said there is central parking provided for the property. Bulls gave an overview of the interpretive center and skate park. Bulls showed the 25% paved area provided for snow storage. He said the bulk of the snow storage will be held inside the arena in the winter. He showed a plan for the utilities and said the surface drainage.

Kurt Eggers Landscape Architect explained the landscape plan, with locations of different trees and shrubs that would be used on the property. The Hailey Parks & Lands Board and Hailey Tree Committee submitted memos of their review of the landscaping for the project. Eggers said there will be drip irrigation to all the plant material and lawns will have an overhead spray. He pointed out the two access locations to the skatepark, with the use of stepping stones so skateboards cannot fly out into the traffic. He pointed out what trees will be removed; 11 Evergreens will come out and 16 will go in, 26 deciduous trees will come out and 40 will go in. He said there will be more planting going in after the removal. He said he did not have any place to relocate the trees coming out but the City said could take them to another location.
Paul Stoops, Multitude Associates, Electrical Engineer and Lighting Designer gave an overview of power for the project and explained the different areas chosen for transformers. He explained the lighting plan with lighting at the entry, parking, pedestrian, building entrance and egress lighting, and the multi use arena lighting. The IES recommends 30 ft candles average for rodeo arena lighting. He said the fixtures would be mounted on four 60 ft poles with 7 fixtures per pole which would give the 30 ft candles for the arena. He said sports lighting will be similar to the High School. He said this will not interfere with the air space and does not expect a problem with the FAA who will be reviewing this. Stoops said the bleachers will also be lighted by the four 60 ft poles. He explained the parking area lighting using the recommended standards from the IES for parking lighting is 1 ft candle and a minimum of 0.1. They will not be installing center poles due to snow storage removal and the larger tractor trailers. He said they are proposing perimeter lighting with 17 ft poles with 175 ml highlights. He also said the entry and exits will be lighted. He said the fixtures will be fully shielded.

Bulls presented the exterior elevations, materials and colors selected for the project and said they have selected warm colors and low maintenance, durable materials. He suggested providing some of the murals on the back of the bleachers and also mentioned the current landscaping along Main Street helps to screen the buildings in the park.

Commissioner Moore asked Stoops about the condition of approval for reduced lumens mentioned on page 4 of the staff report. Stoops said they could use 1000 watt but would have to use more fixtures to meet this requirement. Commissioner Moore said there was a condition of the allowable lumens in parking area and also exceeded the height of the poles. Stoops said that is problematic and said they went 175 watt to meet the minimum of the parking lot and if they went to 70 watt fixtures, it would require another row of fixtures to avoid substandard lighting. Commissioner Moore mentioned the public restroom on the south end of the ice rink and asked if that will be for the public using the ice rink or will they be using the locker rooms on the inside. Bulls said there will be four locker rooms on the inside and the public restroom which is sized for 400 capacity seating for the spectators of the arena. Commissioner Moore said is that being redundant with the other bathroom located off of the skatepark. Latham said they went back and forth with the Parks and Lands Board on whether they really needed that little building and said he was reluctant to have kids inside the ice rink when the building is unsupervised and was concerned about vandalism. He said during the winter the small restroom would be shut down. Commissioner Moore asked the Parks and Lands Board about the ivy and asked if it would be on the bleachers themselves or on the building in front. Janet Fugate, 1110 Echo Hill Drive, Hailey Parks and Lands Board Chair said the vines were on the structural cable going up but not on the bleachers or structure itself. Commissioner Moore asked if they would interfere with a mural. Fugate said that was a good question and said the vines are a suggestion being explored at the moment. Commissioner Moore said the skate park closes at dusk and asked if there would be light from the proposed lights into the skate park in the evening, allowing that use to continue. Stoops said it is minimal, .02 ft candles.

Commissioner Johnstone said there were discussions about phasing the roof on the ice rink and asked if they have explored putting a roof over one side of the arena bleachers and the financial feasibility of putting in footings to allow that at a later date. Latham said they know the expense is considerable so they have not gone there with any specific design; he said it is a significant item to design a roof over the bleachers which will support the snow load.

Commissioner Lloyd asked if the applicant had any questions with the suggested conditions. He said one of the big ones could be the 35 ft guard rail on top of the bleachers. Latham said if it has to be below 35 ft they can take down a few rows of the bleachers. He said they do exceed the 35 ft with the guard rail. He said they have looked to the impacts of the Senior Center to the east.
Eggers mentioned suggested condition, Item j, only drip irrigation will be installed and said they will be using irrigation but will need some overhead spray as well. He commented on Item m, number 7, they did not include an entrance to the skate park directly off of Main Street and said they could certainly do that if it is that important; Item r, will be up to the City and Parks and Lands Board where those trees go, they did not want to be under the expense of relocating the trees. Commissioner Pogue asked if there was anything objectionable to this condition. Latham said the trees could be relocated and said it costs more to move them.

Commissioner Lloyd asked if there has been any discussion to move the large snow storage area to the north at Nelson Field. He suggested the different events in the arena could maybe used for a free style skiing, soccer, and skijoring, or even horse events. Bulls said when the ice melts you really do not want that material melting down into the arena floor. Bulls suggested snow storage could be moved to the north side of the bleachers. Commissioner Lloyd asked about the School District's easement. Latham said the School District has been very cordial towards the city. He said the city met with the school officials and came up with a plan that could be worked out with parking for the pick-ups and stock trailers for the rodeo participants. Commissioner Lloyd asked if anyone had looked at additional architectural elements specifically the east elevation of the ice rink between the main and side entrance towards the northeast side. Latham said in their initial sketches they worked with eyebrows and sun shading devices and there is other design elements for the main entry but because of the budget they pulled back and said felt comfortable where they were and if they were to go beyond this it would affect the budget.

Commissioner Johnstone referred to the south overhang on the roof of the interpretive center and said the sun would be coming in and suggested some shading of the glass to protect the photographs and art displayed inside. Bulls said there is full coverage of the glass in the summer and said in the winter there will be some low levels of light to the bottom portion of the glass. Commissioner Johnstone said the memo from the Parks and Lands Board stated they wanted to incorporate public art. He said as a suggested condition of approval he would like to add that prior to implementation there shall be a submittal to the Hailey Arts Commission with all public art proposals.

Commissioner Pogue said the applicant indicated the arena was limited to a height limit of 35 ft and confirmed that they would loose two rows of bleachers and asked how many rows per side. Bulls said 14 rows on north and south and 16 rows on the east side which is problematic. He said to pick up the seating capacity they would have to increase the width of north and south. Commissioner Pogue asked if that was feasible and Bulls thought that would be doable. Commissioner Pogue asked why they needed overhead spray irrigation. Eggers said the natural grass areas require it and the water savings would be at least 50%.

Public Hearing Opened

Kelly Hewitt, 2026 Shooting Star Lane referred to the proposed plan for snow removal and said it will not work because they have a venue scheduled for the first part of May and those snow piles currently there are not drying up. He also said there is not enough space in the arena for skijoring. He said if the arena was actually flooded that would not be good for the arena floor. He said for the first two venues they would have to haul bark in to prevent trudging through the mud on the inside of the arena floor; then they would have to haul the bark out. He would like to see more research for the snow removal plan.

Commissioner Pogue asked what group he was with. Hewitt said he is with the Sawtooth Rangers. Commissioner Pogue asked if the Sawtooth Rangers were involved with design or development of
this plan.

**Bill Bobbitt**, with the Sawtooth Rangers said yes and commented on the location of the announcer’s booth; he said it is better for them to look down into the bucking shoots. He said there is too much room for error with the way the gates are, it will block the rodeo official’s view and the timing of the animals coming out of the shoots. He said the stock contractor has a 52 ft trailer and commented that he could get in there and said it looks a little tight around the corner with the landscaping located there.

**Becky Stokes**, 617 Third Ave North, employee of City of Hailey has been involved with hockey for 12 years and is excited about this. She was concerned as an environmentalist with the lighting of the ice rink. She believed the City Engineer spoke about LED lights and encouraged them to take a look at that because the size of the transformers, the power draw on all aspects of it as well as the heating for the of the ice rink. She said the lighting for the arena is a quick on quick off.

**Bud Amos**, Sawtooth Rangers Arena Director heard Stoops say something about the lumens coming off of the arena and said they do not want to have the lighting limited in the arena. He said potentially down the road it could go to a different phase of rodeo. He said currently they are at the lowest level of rodeo there is.

**Public Hearing Closed**

**Latham addressed public comments:**

- The snow storage would either have to go inside the arena or hauled off.

- LEDs are fairly new, they reduce a lot of energy and there are a lot of good advantages and it is not regulated right now too well and there are a lot of claims out there right now.

- The lighting would not be limited in the arena and there could always be fixtures added. Latham also said that during the summer months there is light there until late in the evening. Stoops said the infrastructure there does not require more poles – and the next step up is 50 foot candles and it would not be hard to get to there; a retrofit is not a big problem. Latham suggested Stoops go there and see what is there now compared to what is proposed and see what kind of options there are.

- Regarding the 52 ft trailer, they met with the stock contractor and some of the members of the Sawtooth Rangers and the radii is 28 ft which is a normal fire truck radius. He thinks if he swings out enough he could make it. He said they will look at this.

Amos asked if there is any arena watering system. Latham no, they have not gotten that far yet but said they will put in an irrigation system on the inside floor of the arena. He said the Commission should be aware that when there is an event in the arena such as a cutting even, the soil is watered down on the arena floor. He said when they have a three day rodeo event they do not want to be down there all the time watering so there will be irrigation on the inside.

Commissioner Pogue asked the applicant if they had any problem with moving the announcer’s booth. The applicant said no.
Deliberation

Commissioner Lloyd suggested speaking with the School District regarding different snow storage areas. He said Planner Platt did a very good job putting all the suggested conditions together.

Commissioner Johnstone thinks it is a great project and the applicant has worked well with the different parties. He also commended Planner Platt.

Commissioner Moore is excited but agrees with the Building Department’s concern with the ADA parking located in the center. Latham said they agreed that it needs to be pushed to the outside. Commissioner Moore is concerned with the entry off of Main Street at the Skatepark which might be misconstrued as a drop off point with children, especially with that busy intersection there. He thought the two locations that they pointed out would be appropriate. He spoke about the setback on the eastside and found in Article 4.13 Bulk Requirements of the Townsite Overlay in Article 7.1, “Cornices, canopies, eaves or similar roof overhang features and cantilevered balconies extend into a required yard setback not more than three (3) feet.” He thinks he is okay with the bleachers overhanging into the setback right now.

Commissioner Pogue asked staff, on proposed condition j, whether there is any issue with modifying “the no drip irrigation systems shall be installed” to say “shall be installed where feasible”. Planner Platt said that sentence in j was taken from either Parks and Lands or the Tree Committee Memo and said there is nothing in our Ordinance that states they cannot have that, it just says they are discouraged. Commissioner Pogue suggested to change to drip irrigation be encouraged whenever feasible. Commissioner Pogue asked the Commissioners if they had any issues with that.

Commissioner Pogue stated to staff the applicant indicated potentially some difficulty with condition k) 2. i. regarding the 70 watt metal halide replacing the proposed 175 watt metal halide. Planner Platt said the condition is according to the tables that are incorporated in the Outdoor Lighting Ordinance which lists the maximum lumen level standards at various heights above ground level. Commissioner Pogue asked if it was a recommendation, not a requirement. Planner Platt stated it is a requirement. Director Robrahm said they should do some research to see if our Outdoor Lighting Ordinance could be updated. She said it might be an appropriate time to update some of the standards; they will be looking into that and this is something that can be revisited later.

Commissioner Pogue has not pressed the applicant although he feels there is some difficulty in meeting this so he said to leave what is in there for now. He says if it poses a real issue we could look at it at another time.

Commissioner Pogue said he liked the idea that the Hailey Arts Commission review and make comments and suggestions on all public art proposals. He would not go as far as to say the final decision would be left to them. Commissioner Johnstone said it would be approved by the City Council. The Commissioners agreed to include, prior to implementation the Arts Commission will review all public arts.

Planner Platt said conditions d and t are essentially the same so the new condition would be t. Director Robrahm said the relocation of the announcer’s booth to be moved would be condition u.

Commissioner Lloyd moved to approve the City of Hailey’s design review application for the Hailey Rodeo Park, located on portions of the lots located within Block 126, portions of the lots and alley located within Block 127, all of Block 134 and vacated portions of the Second
Avenue, First Avenue and Cedar Street right-of-way (781 Main Street South), within the limited business (LB) and Townsite Overlay (TO) districts, finding that the project is in conformance with the Comprehensive Plan, that the project does not jeopardize the health, safety, or welfare of the general public, and that the project conforms to the applicable specifications outlined in the Design Review Guidelines, as set forth herein, applicable requirements of the Zoning Ordinance, and City Standards; with conditions (a) through (u), replacing condition t with Prior to implementation the Arts Commission will review all public arts, and adding condition u) The rodeo’s announcers booth shall be moved to the requested location. Moore seconded, the motion passed unanimously.

Unfinished Business

Idaho Power Conditional Use Permit & Design Review

Continuation of a public hearing upon applications by Idaho Power for a Conditional Use Permit for the Hailey Substation and Design Review of improvements including but not limited to five (5) new power poles and a dead end structure to serve the Hailey Substation, located on Lots 1 - 11, N 8 ½' of Lot 12, and Lots 13-23, NE 20’ and N 8 ½' of Lot 24, Block 90, Hailey Townsite, SW 20’ of 6th Ave and the alley within Block 90 (251 N 6th Ave) within the Limited Residential (LR) district. Design Review is required for any new structures. In addition, the Hailey Substation is currently considered an existing nonconforming use. A Public Utility Facility is a permitted conditional use within the LR zone with approval of a Conditional Use Permit.

Public comments received from Nathan Bingham, 211 Sixth Ave. North were received by email and distributed to the Commission and applicant.

Director Robrahn met with Idaho Power on March 8th to discuss a 3rd party review. Between March 1st and March 8th Idaho Power were told by their management not to be involved with the drafting of a RFP. However, Idaho Power did discuss an alternative to the dead end structure which was described in the staff report for the Commission’s consideration. She showed some pictures for a reconfiguration of the dead end structure to be replaced with a smaller structure. The alternative structure is 21 ft, supported by 3 lolly columns at 16 ft.

Mike Barrie Idaho Power said the reason they did not use the smaller structure in the beginning was because the dead end structure was the standard structure used.

Bryan Hansen, Engineer for Idaho Power said they propose to replace the current structure by removing the top half of the existing structure. They would install three lolly columns. They showed the lolly columns photos. He showed the site plan, showing what they would be doing by removing the top.

Director Robrahn showed the difference in the site plan between the existing and the proposed structure.

Hansen said the overall impact would be smaller and they can still serve their purpose.

Commissioner Pogue asked Director Robrahn if she would like the Commission to look at both the CUP and Design Review together. She said yes and the staff reports cover the CUP and DR standards. She suggested looking at the CUP first. She said everything is essentially the same except for the new structure.
Commissioner Johnstone referred to page 6 of the staff report for the CUP and mentioned there is a recommendation on the landscaping but it was not listed as part of the conditions. Director Robrahm wanted to leave that up to the Commission to decide if they wanted that as a condition or not.

Barrie displayed the landscaping plan which was submitted when they did landscaping in the past. He said if there is additional landscaping required the fence runs along the property line. He said landscaping would also be encroaching on the open utility easement. He said if it is a condition they would have to go back and see what they could do. He said the landscape architect said if there are too many trees it could stunt the growth of other trees.

Director Robrahm said there were conditions regarding the fence and the building to be painted. She said Idaho Power has brought an example of the fencing.

Barrie said it is a newer vinyl fencing they have been using; the slats do not slide in and out and come in various colors. Commissioner Johnstone asked what happens when a slat gets broken. Darling said they can be replaced. Hansen said they do not vibrate and have a 30 year warranty. Commissioner Johnstone said the sample said a 7 year limited warranty.

Director Robrahm said, for clarification, currently the design review prohibits chain link fences. The Council thought it would be appropriate to allow chain link fences for public uses and public utilities. She said there is a current amendment that reflects that change.

Barrie said a brick wall would be very expensive and they would have to see if that would be allowed by their management.

Commissioner Johnstone asked how long the reconfiguration and conversion will take. Darling said it would take 2 months. Barrie said they would put the poles in first in 3 to 5 working days after the crew is scheduled; and they would address the corona noise then. He said they will have to wait until the snow is gone to replace the fence and paint the building.

Director Robrahm asked if they would need the mobile transformer. Darling said no.

Commissioner Lloyd asked staff if the Tree Committee should be involved. Director Robrahm did not believe that was part of their mission.

**Public Hearing Opened**

**Bernie Johnson,** 341 Mother Lode Loop is concerned with the upkeep of the property and told Idaho Power they should be ashamed. Johnson said if there were to be any additional landscaping he suggested for it to be included on the west side.

**Bill Mallica,** 209 Sixth Ave. North was concerned with the fence and would like to see the possibility of a CMU block fence on their side of the property. He said their maximum fence height is lower than that of Idaho Powers fence so they really would not be able to hide their fence.

**Michael Breen,** 517 Bullion St. East said he was not notified about this meeting and heard about this meeting this morning on KECH radio. He said there are a lot of factors. He said the new structure is more neighborhood friendly and he did not know why they did not put that in the first place. He does not think Idaho Power has addressed the issues of the EMFs. He suggested having more neighbors present before the Commission makes a suggestion.
Mallea did not catch the height for the three additional poles. He commented on the reliability of bringing in power from both sides, and mentioned the power outage over the holidays.

Barrie responded to the public comments.

- On the west elevation the landscaping is not on their property. He would like to know how much landscaping the city would want them to add; he mentioned that once the fence is up it would change the view.

- The fencing in the subdivision, if a brick wall was required, they would have to take that back to management to see how they want to go. Commissioner Moore asked if that was a cost issue. Barrie explained it is cost and for security and safety reasons they need to be able to see if anyone is inside.

Director Robrahn suggested maybe a fence façade in front of the existing chain link would be appropriate. She said there is still a huge concern with security and the fence around the substation needed to be taller.

Hansen said they do have plans to address future growth.

Commissioner Pogue asked the height of the lolly poles. Hansen said 28 feet.

Commissioner Pogue commented on the notice issue. He recognized it is difficult to follow an application that is discussed over the course of several meetings. He suggested having a sheet for those who would like to be notified by leaving their email address.

**Public Hearing Closed**

**Deliberation**

Commissioner Johnstone agreed with the comments about the landscaping and the fencing and would like to come to some possible mitigation for the neighbors with the current buzzing. He said the new structure is definitely better.

Commissioner Moore said the new structure is 6 ft lower which is an improvement. He said it would be a great idea for Idaho Power to get together with the neighbors. He suggested using earth tone colors and suggested some trees be put in between the poles to break it up.

Commissioner Lloyd agreed with Commissioner Johnstone with the lack of maintenance. He suggested that Idaho Power keep up with the maintenance.

Commissioner Johnstone asked if there is any room on the west side to put any landscaping on the inside of the station.

Barrie said possibly on the north end where the two gates are. He said they do not normally put landscaping on the inside of the fence.

Commissioner Pogue said they will be better served with keeping up with maintenance. He said it would be better if they had come before the fact. He said maybe they could have a landscape architect come in and meet with the neighbors.
Barrie said they could do that.

Commissioner Pogue said it is not an attractive fence and did not think a CMU wall would be attractive either.

Director Robrahm suggested a cedar dog eared fence could be put in front of the proposed fence for screening.

Commissioner Pogue suggested condition d with the CUP permit, applies to everything; he suggested to add buildings and other improvements.

Director Robrahm said two motions are needed; one for the Conditional Use Permit and one for the Design Review.

Commissioner Johnstone moved to approve the Conditional Use Permit application for Idaho Power for the Hailey Substation and Design Review of improvements including but not limited to five (5) new power poles and the reconfigured dead end structure to serve the Hailey Substation, located on Lots 1 - 11, N 8 ½’ of Lot 12, and Lots 13-23, NE 20’ and N 8 ½’ of Lot 24, Block 9, Hailey Townsite, finding that it constitutes a conditional use as established for the zoning district involved; will be harmonious with and in accordance with the general objectives or any specific objective of the Comprehensive Plan and requirements of this Ordinance; will be designed, constructed, operated, and maintained to be harmonious and appropriate in appearance with the existing or intended character of the general vicinity, and that such use will not change the essential character of the same area; will not be hazardous or disturbing to existing or future neighboring uses; will be served adequately by essential public facilities and services such as highways, streets, police and fire protection, and drainage structure. Agencies responsible for the establishment of the proposed use will be able to provide adequately any such service; will not create excessive additional requirements at public cost for public facilities and services; will not involve uses, activities, processes, materials, equipment, or conditions of operation that will be detrimental to any persons, property, or the general welfare by reason of excessive production of traffic, noise, smoke, fumes, glare, dust, odors, vibration, water or air pollution, or safety hazards; will have vehicular approaches to the property, which shall be designed so as not to create an interference with traffic on surrounding public thoroughfares; will not result in the destruction, loss, or damage of natural, scenic, or historic features; as set forth herein, applicable requirements of the Zoning Ordinance, and City Standards; with conditions a) through e), e) being to submit a landscape plan for the west side and the fencing to the south side, to the Administrator to be approved on the Commission’s Consent Agenda. Commissioner Moore seconded, the motion passed unanimously.

Commissioner Moore moved to approve the design review application of the Hailey substation upgrade located at Lots 1 - 11, N 8 ½’ of Lot 12, and Lots 13-23, NE 20’ and N 8 ½’ of Lot 24, Block 90, Hailey Townsite, SW 20’ of 6th Ave and the alley within Block 90 (251 N 6th Ave), finding that the project is in conformance with the Comprehensive Plan; the project does not jeopardize the health, safety, or welfare of the general public; and the project conforms to the applicable specifications outlined in the Design Review Guidelines, as set forth herein, applicable requirements of the Zoning Ordinance, and City Standards; with conditions (a) through (e), e) being to submit a landscape plan for the west side and the fencing to the south
side, to the Administrator to be approved on the Commission’s Consent Agenda. Commissioner Johnstone seconded, the motion passed unanimously.

Director Robrahn suggested continuing the following public hearings to March 29th.

Commissioner Johnstone moved to continue a City Initiated Text Amendment to Hailey Zoning Ord. #532, Section 6A, Design Review, City Initiated Text Amendment to Hailey Subdivision Ord. #821, Sec 4.2, Sidewalks & Pathways, and City Initiated Text Amendment to all Sections of the Hailey Comprehensive Plan, Economic Development, Housing, and Community Design sections to March 29, 2010. Commissioner Lloyd seconded, the motion passed unanimously.

Adjourn
Commissioner Moore moved to adjourn the meeting at 8:56 pm. Commissioner Johnstone seconded, the motion passed unanimously.